



AGENDA

The meeting will be held at **10:00 via Skype for Business.**

This will be preceded by a pre-meeting of the governors and the auditors from **09:30 via Skype for Business.**

PRELIMINARY ITEMS		Item	Led by
1	Apologies	Verbal	N Whitaker
2	Declarations of Interest	Verbal	N Whitaker
3.1	Minutes of the joint meeting with the Finance, Staffing & Resources Committee and the Audit Committee held on 17 April 2020	AUD-1920-053a CONFIDENTIAL	N Whitaker
3.2	Minutes of the last meeting held on 17 April 2020	AUD-1920-053b CONFIDENTIAL	N Whitaker
3.3	Minutes of the extraordinary meeting held on 21 May 2020	AUD-1920-053c CONFIDENTIAL	N Whitaker
4	Matters Arising	AUD-1920-054 CONFIDENTIAL	N Whitaker
RISK MANAGEMENT		Item	Led by
5	Outcomes of the Student Data Return Review	Presentation CONFIDENTIAL	A Fern
6	Corporate Risk and Assurance Register	AUD-1920-057 CONFIDENTIAL	C Thomas
7	Risk Management Deep Dive: West Yorkshire Pension Fund	AUD-1920-055 CONFIDENTIAL <i>To Follow</i>	H Paver
INTERNAL AUDIT		Item	Led by
8	Internal Audit Progress Report	AUD-1920-059 CONFIDENTIAL	KPMG
9	Internal Audit Report: HE-BCI	AUD-1920-060 CONFIDENTIAL	KPMG

10	Draft Internal Audit Plan 2020/21	AUD-1920-061 CONFIDENTIAL <i>To Follow</i>	KPMG
----	-----------------------------------	---	------

EXTERNAL AUDIT		Item	Led by
-----------------------	--	-------------	---------------

11	Draft External Audit Strategy and Operational Plan 2020/21**	AUD-1920-062 CONFIDENTIAL <i>To Follow</i>	BDO
----	--	---	-----

12	HEI Bulletin: Going concern considerations for the audit year ending 31 July 2020	AUD-1920-063 CONFIDENTIAL	BDO
----	---	-------------------------------------	-----

GOVERNANCE AND COMPLIANCE		Item	Led by
----------------------------------	--	-------------	---------------

13	Reportable Events: update report	AUD-1920-064 CONFIDENTIAL	A Kennell
----	----------------------------------	-------------------------------------	-----------

14	Research Misconduct & Research Integrity - Annual Report 2019/20	AUD-1920-065	C Barnes
----	--	--------------	----------

OTHER BUSINESS		Item	Led by
-----------------------	--	-------------	---------------

15	Draft Schedule of Business 2020/21	AUD-1920-066	N Whitaker
----	------------------------------------	--------------	------------

16	Annual review of committee membership	Verbal	C Thomas
----	---------------------------------------	--------	----------

17	Other Urgent Business		N Whitaker
----	-----------------------	--	------------

Details of next meeting:
The next meeting of the Audit Committee will be held 10:00 – 13:00 on Friday 06 November 2020, venue to be confirmed.

This will be preceded by a pre-meeting of the governors and the auditors from 09:30.

Holly Lewis

Shaded items indicate that the Committee is being asked to make a decision.

*Starred items will be taken without discussion unless a member notifies the Chair or Secretary in advance that she or he wishes the item to be open for debate.

**The draft External Audit Strategy and Operational Plan 2020/21 (item 11) is subject to change following receipt of the clearance letter from EY.



Research Misconduct & Research Integrity Annual Report – 2019/20

Purpose of Report

Section 24 of the 'Delegated Authority' section of the Audit Committee's current Terms of Reference states that the Audit Committee has delegated authority to '*monitor the University's risk from research misconduct*'. The Committee discharges this responsibility through the consideration of this annual report.

The report provides the Audit Committee with the University's Annual Statement on Research Integrity. In compliance with the Concordat to Support Research Integrity, the University publishes a Statement on Research Integrity on an annual basis. The following Statement covers the 2019/20 academic year and summarises the University's status relative to the expectations of the Concordat. It outlines the actions and activities undertaken, and framework in place in support of fostering a culture of research integrity. It also provides, if any have occurred, a high-level summary of investigations of allegations of research misconduct that have been undertaken by the University.

Action Requested

The report is **for information and to note.**

Key Issues

During 2019/20 no cases of research misconduct were recorded or reported.

Author

Name: Stuart Morris (REF & Research Policy Manager)

Date: 22 May 2020

Approval Route

Name: Professor Cathy Barnes (Director of Research & Enterprise)

Date: 26 May 2020

Name: Research & Enterprise Committee

Date: 03 June 2020

Research Misconduct & Research Integrity Annual Report – 2019/20

1. The University is committed to supporting the highest standards of research integrity which are reflected in the [Concordat to Support Research Integrity](#).
2. The Concordat sets out the following five commitments for universities to comply with:
 - [Commitment #1](#) - maintaining the highest standards of rigour and integrity in all aspects of research;
 - [Commitment #2](#) - ensuring that research is conducted according to appropriate ethical, legal and professional frameworks, obligations and standards;
 - [Commitment #3](#) - supporting a research environment that is underpinned by a culture of integrity and based on good governance, best practice and support for the development of researchers;
 - [Commitment #4](#) - using transparent, robust and fair processes to deal with allegations of research misconduct should they arise; and
 - [Commitment #5](#) - working together to strengthen the integrity of research and to reviewing progress regularly and openly.
3. Our University is compliant with all of the commitments set out in the Concordat:
 - a. The University has a [Code of Good Practice for Research](#) , approved by the Academic Board, that promotes honesty and openness in research, provides clear information for researchers on the standards they are expected to follow when conducting research;
 - b. The Research Team, as part of Research & Enterprise, has responsibility for ensuring that all proposals for research projects submitted by academics for external funding are subject to ethical review and meet external sponsor requirements;
 - c. The Graduate School, as part of Research & Enterprise has responsibility for ensuring that the quality of processes and procedures relating to research degree programmes and in the training and development of academic staff and research students are appropriate and in line with best practice;
 - d. Our University is compliant with the QAA Quality Code, Part B: Assuring and Enhancing Academic Quality, Chapter B11: Research Degrees, expectations and indicators and has robust procedures in the management of research students;
 - e. The University's internal Peer Review and Approval process, as co-ordinated by the Research Team, safeguards the quality of external research grant applications and compliance with funding organisations prior to submission;
 - f. All research projects are subject to ethical scrutiny and the University's Research Ethics Sub- Committee maintains oversight of the implementation of the University's [Research Ethics Policy](#) & [Research Ethics Procedures](#) relating to research ethics and conducts an annual audit to assure itself of compliance by staff and students in the University.

Research Governance

4. The importance of the promotion of research leadership is detailed in the [University's Code of Good Practice for Research](#) and the support for the needs of new researchers is strongly promoted.
5. The University is a continuing member of Vitae which helps to inform best practice in the programme of support for researchers. The University also holds the HR Excellence in Research Award.
6. The Graduate School is responsible for the organisation of the staff and research student development programme that demonstrates the commitment to developing our academic staff and research students, in line with the Concordat and Vitae's Researcher Development Framework, through a range of training opportunities on all aspects of research activity. Continued professional development funding which supports researchers with conferences, higher degrees and other related expenses is also available.
7. The [Policy & Procedures for Investigating Allegations of Misconduct in Research](#) provides detailed information on the University's Policy for sustaining integrity in all aspects of research; a comprehensive set of procedures for use when investigating allegations of misconduct in research; and guidance on the appropriate disciplinary procedures associated with findings of misconduct in research. We believe them to be transparent, robust and fair in order to deal with allegations of research misconduct should they arise. They have been benchmarked against, and are compatible with, the principles of the Universities UK Concordat to support research integrity (2012), the RCUK Policy and Guidelines on the Governance of Good Research Conduct (2013) and the UK Research Integrity Office's Procedure for the Investigation of Misconduct in Research (2008). They have also been benchmarked against a number of comparator UK universities, to ensure that they are up- to-date and aligned with good practice in the sector.
8. The Research & Enterprise Committee advises the Academic Board on the development, review and implementation of the sections of the University's Academic Regulations related to research and associated policies and procedures, in light of developing national and international expectations. Investigations into allegations of research misconduct are reported through the University's governance structures and an anonymised overview report is presented, for monitoring purposes, to the Audit Committee on an annual basis.
9. As a condition of any research grant, the UK Research Councils require that universities in receipt of research funding have in place policies and procedures to ensure good practice in research and the avoidance of research misconduct. Research Councils have been asked by their Audit Committees to ensure that any instances of possible research misconduct are

being addressed, and that work which is funded is not exposed to any undue risk from misconduct. As part of that assurance, Research Councils UK has asked that the Audit Committee is made aware of our regulations and procedures relating to good practice and research misconduct; and that the Committee receive an annual report on any issues which may have arisen. The following documents are published on the University website and form a framework to ensure good practice in research and clear procedures for dealing with any issues which arise in this area:

- a. [Research Ethics Policy](#)
- b. [Research Ethics Procedures](#)
- c. [Academic Regulations: Chapter 11 Research Awards](#) which detail that the circumstances of a claim of Research Misconduct will be investigated in line with the provisions of our Research Misconduct Procedure;
- d. [Policy & Procedures for Investigating Allegations of Misconduct in Research University's Code of Good Practice for Research](#)

Activities 2019/20

10. During 2019/20, the following activities took place to support the University's commitment to supporting the highest standards of research integrity: *(The relevant Concordat commitment is indicated in parenthesis)*
11. The Research Ethics Sub-Committee received the annual research ethics audits from the Schools. The audit reports provided assurance that research ethics was being managed by the Schools and that practice was compliant with the University research ethics policy and procedures. Throughout 2019/20 the Sub-Committee monitored the implementation of the actions plans that came out of the school research ethics audits to ensure that any recommendations for improving practice were implemented (#1; #2).
12. The Research Ethics Sub-Committee received a standing report at each meeting detailing any applications for research ethics approval under the remit of the Prevent Duty (#2).
13. The Chair of the Research Ethics Sub-Committee delivered a number of research ethics training sessions to Local Research Ethics co-ordinators and School Research Ethics Co-ordinators (#3).
14. The Graduate School oversees and manages the Research Training Programme (RTP). The RTP is based on Vitae's Researcher Development Framework and provides opportunities for research students to develop key research and professional skills to help them with their studies and future career progression. The RTP includes core elements and is complemented by school subject specific workshops. Each Research student attends a central induction at the beginning of their programme of study and two development days that covers by example, methodologies.

15. The Graduate School oversees and manages a comprehensive programme for academic development in all aspects of research. There is an established development programme for academic staff to become research supervisors, which includes 'Becoming a Research Awards supervisor' and training for 'Experienced Supervisors' as well as training for Independent Chairs and internal examiners. (#3).
16. The Research Ethics Committee considered and agreed that the University adopt the Global Code of Conduct for research in resource-poor settings. Institutions applying the Code of Conduct oppose double standards in research and support long-term equitable research relationships between partners in low-income and high-income settings based on fairness, respect, care and honesty. (#2).
17. The Research Ethics Sub-Committee received an update concerning the University guidance on GDPR issues related to research ethics with particular focus on the handling and retention of research data which is processed by researchers working on behalf of the University. It was agreed to review the current research ethics Policy and Procedures to ensure that they remained current and in compliance with current practice. (#2).
18. The Research & Enterprise Committee considered a report concerning the Trusted Research Campaign which had been developed by the developed by the Centre for the Protection of National Infrastructure (CPNI) and the National Cyber Security Centre (NCSC) to raise awareness of the risks associated with research collaborations that involve organisations or research partners with links. The Trusted Research campaign and associated guidance aims to secure the integrity of the system of international research collaboration. The Committee considered the review of how the University's current practice aligned with the Trusted Research guidance and approved a recommendations concerning the further development of the University's policy and procedures for managing the risks associated with international collaborative research. (#2).
19. The Director of Research & Enterprise, the Chair of the Research Ethics Sub-Committee and the REF & Research Policy Manager began the process to review the University's online ethical approval system to ensure the that it continues to be the best option to implement the Research Ethics approval process set out in the University's Research Ethics Procedures. This review will carry on into the 2020/21 academic year. (#2, #5).
20. The REF & Research Policy Manager began Che process to review the University's compliance with the Revised Concordat to Support Research Integrity (published in 2019). A self-audit of how the University complies with the revised Concordat is underway and further work will be carried out at the end of 2019/20 and into 2020/21 to review the University's policies and procedures for research ethics against the newly published UKRIO guidance, Research Ethics Support and Review in Research Organisations , which offers benchmark policies and processes which organisations can use to create, revise or audit institutional practices in

order to support the functions of research ethics committees. The guidance also synthesises developments in academic work on ethics and integrity, the expectations of research funders and government and existing examples of good practice, to help researchers and organisations to develop a positive culture of integrity and ethics in research. (#2, #5).

21. In addition to the actions listed above, the University's continued review and monitoring of processes, policies and training in particular through the Research & Enterprise Committee, the Research Ethics Sub-Committee, and the Research Degrees Sub-Committee, will ensure the University's ongoing commitment to high quality and ethical research.
22. In 2019/20 the University benefitted from membership of the UK Research Integrity Office (UKRIO) further enhancing and promoting research integrity and oversight of best practice of our research activity.

Investigations of allegations of research misconduct

23. During 2019/20 no cases of research misconduct were recorded or reported.



Draft Schedule of Business 2020/21

Purpose of Report

The Audit Committee's schedule of meetings and draft schedule of business for 2020/21 is attached and will be considered at each meeting across the academic year and updated accordingly.

Action Requested

The report is **for information and to note.** The Committee is invited to receive and note the report, and to consider whether any additional items should be added to the 2020/21 schedule of business.

Author

June 2020 - Holly Lewis, Governance Co-ordinator

Audit Committee Schedule of Business 2020/21

**recommendation made to the Board of Governors*

Friday 06 November 2020, 10:00 – 13:00, G05 Old Broadcasting House (09:30 pre-meeting)	Friday 22 January 2021, 10:00 – 13:00, G05 Old Broadcasting House (09:30 pre-meeting)	Friday 23 April 2021, 10:00 – 13:00, G05 Old Broadcasting House (09:30 pre-meeting)	Friday 25 June 2021, 10:00 – 13:00, G05 Old Broadcasting House (09:30 pre-meeting)
<i>Report deadline: 27 October 2020</i>	<i>Report deadline: 12 January 2021</i>	<i>Report deadline: 13 April 2021</i>	<i>Report deadline: 16 June 2021</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • *Terms of Reference & Membership • Sector wide DLHE data (<i>Matters Arising update</i>) – C Prince • Risk Management Deep Dive: TBC • Internal Audit Reports: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – (19/20) IT – (19/20) Data Management in HR – (19/20) Estates – TBC • 2019/20 Internal Audit Feedback • Risk Management Framework and Annual Policy review (*changes on risk appetite recommended to the Board) • Annual review of compliance with published information requirements • Data Quality Management Report 2019/20 • Internal Audit Annual Opinion 2019/20 • *External Audit Report / External Management Letter for the Year Ended 31 July 2020 • *Draft Financial Statements for the Year Ended 31 July 2010 • *Audit Committee Annual Report and Opinion for the Year Ended 31 July 2020 • *Prevent Annual Accountability and Data Return • Annual Report on Fraud • University's Ethics Framework policies (<i>previous titled Integrity Framework</i>) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Risk Management Deep Dive: TBC • Internal Audit Progress Report • Internal Audit Reports: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – TBC • *Annual review of our Financial Regulations • Transparent Approach to Costing (TRAC) return • Transparent Approach to Costing for Teaching (TRAC(T)) return • Annual Procurement update • Review of the HESA return 2019/20 • Whistleblowing Policy & Procedure - Annual Review 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Risk Management Deep Dive: <i>Business Engagement – C Prince</i> • Internal Audit Progress Report • Internal Audit Reports: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – TBC • Counter-Fraud & Anti-Bribery Policy and Fraud Response Plan - Annual Review • Draft External Audit Strategy and Operational Plan 2021/22 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Risk Management Deep Dive: TBC • Overview of the risk assessments appended to Corporate Risk & Assurance Register • Internal Audit Progress Report • Internal Audit Reports: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – TBC • Draft Internal Audit Plan 2021/22 • 2020/21 Internal Audit Feedback • Research Misconduct & Research Integrity - Annual Report • Annual review of compliance with published information requirements • Annual Review of Committee Terms of Reference & Membership (*changes recommended to the Board) • Draft Schedule of Business 2021/22
Standing items			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Corporate Risk & Assurance Register (last meeting of the year to include overview of the risk assessments across the academic year) • Internal Audit Progress Report • Reportable Events • Matters Arising report to monitor compliance-related training (Prevent; IT Security; Anti-Bribery and Counter Fraud; Data Protection) 			